Docklands Going Wrong?

Prof. Andrew MacLaran
Department of Geography, Trinity College Dublin
amclaran@tcd.ie

Dr. Sinéad Kelly,
Department of Geography, Maynooth University
Sinead.m.kelly@nuim.ie
Economic base

• Declining industrial land uses, 1966-85
  – Closures
  – Suburbanisation of manufacturing & warehousing

Figure 10.1 Industrial land-use change in central Dublin, 1966-85.
Population & housing

- **Long-term pop. decline**
  - 1911 pop 240,000
  - 1979 pop 104,000

- **Remaining population**
  - Low level of **skills**
  - High **unemployment**
  - Small hh. & **elderly**

- **Poor housing (1974)**
  - 40% lack bath
  - 25% blgs in poor condition
  - Poorly maintained local-authority dwellings
1985: 600 cleared sites & derelict buildings in the CBD itself (metered parking area)

Combined area of 160 acres (65ha.)
Docklands: on the eastern edge of the CBD
Disused wet docks; derelict land; eyesore industries; scrap metal dealing; live animal exports; truck haulage yards; surface car parking etc.
But did give some employment relevant to the low skills levels of local residents
Unemployment

• Changing cargo-handling (pallets & containers) required only 10% of original labour force

• Unemployment (mid 1980s)
  – Inner-city @ 35%
  – Sheriff Street @ 83%
    (social housing)

• Created a **package of incentives** aimed at encouraging development

• **Aims:**
  – To **stimulate private sector interest** in inner-city renewal
  – To **boost employment** construction sector which had an unemployment rate of 45%
• **Strategic alliances** forged between *urban planners* the economic *boosterism lobby* and *property development sector* to:
  
  – **Re-invent the image** of the city by changing its reality
  
  – Make it “**liveable**” (i.e. *attractive to middle-class*) promoting “**Gentrification**”
  
  – Create a landscape **iconographic of economic success & growth** (“**Can-Do City**”)

• **City planning** became a **strategic process** guiding development according to **agendas** set by *urban ‘boosterism’ lobbies in inter-city competition*
  
  – business and real estate

---

Dublin docklands regeneration
Success measured by the number of cranes on the skyline
Initial impact at Custom House Docks
Impact of incentives: capital returns to the inner city

An apple ripe for plucking...?

Land becomes regarded as a valuable resource - a veritable forgotten crock of gold
Custom House Docks Development Authority (CHDDA)

• **Special-Purpose Agency (1986)** established to fast-track development @ Custom House Docks
  – 11 ha. later extended to 21ha.

• **Planning control expropriated** from Dublin Corporation and vested in CHDDA

• **Development competition** won by UK-Irish consortium (CHDD Company)

• **No residents** lived within CHDDA boundaries
  – but CHDDA & CHDDC *never engaged in dialogue* with adjacent local community
International Financial Services Centre (1987)

• Government decision to locate IFSC at the Custom House Docks
  – 10% corporate tax rate on off-shore finance operations

  • Financing & treasury operations
  • Currency & futures fund management
  • Securities trading
  • Insurance & reinsurance
  • Aircraft financing & leasing

Indicative of the type of functions to be prioritised
  - irrelevant to locals’ needs
Social Segregation

• Epitomised by “Berlin Wall”

• Custom House Dock - Sheriff St. interface
  – 20 ft. wall surmounted by wire-mesh fence
  
  – …but even worse.....
Development fast-tracked by land sales

Public-sector housing sold off to developers @ fire-sale prices for redevelopment

- **Sheriff Street**
  - 9.8 acre (4 ha) site
  - 113 public-sector apartments
  - Sold to Chesterbridge Ir£2.4M (€3.1 M)
  - Redeveloped for 580 private-sector apartments

- At height of boom, no inner city land <€25M/ha
CHDDA Phases 1 & 2
-north quays development

- 330 apartments
- 1.4M sq.ft. (130,000 sq.m.) commercial buildings

By 1998, 2nd largest offshore financial centre in Europe

430 commercial operations

1,400 people employed @ av. salary of €60,00 in 2009
Dublin Docklands Development Authority (DDDA, 1997)

- CHDDA superceded by DDDA & remit extended to 526 ha.

- Did *not* have total planning powers

- But did have power to declare S.25 special fast-track planning areas
1997, Dublin Docklands Development Authority (DDDA) – 526 ha.
Section 25 Planning Scheme Areas

International Financial Services Centre

1 & 2 (21.2ha)

Phase 1:
330 apartments
130,000m² non residential
Docklands North Lotts Area Planning Scheme (32.7ha)

Circa:
4000 apartments
470,000m² non residential
Grand Canal Docks Area
Planning Scheme (38.2ha)

Circa:
3300 apartments
450,000m² non residential
DDDA’s Community Liaison Committee

Unlike CHDDA the CLC important gains

**Housing:**

20% social/affordable housing rule

- Clarion Quay, 187 apts.
- High-density & high value
- >€235,000 for 1-bed apts. to €1.9M for 3-bed riverfront penthouse
  - 20% allocated to Cluid (Hs. Assoc.)
  - Allocated to people on social hsg. waiting list

**Education:**

Child psychologist service, psychometric testing, a ‘Circle Time’ programme and educational scholarship programme

1997, 35% of Docklands children dropped out of school prior to age 12; down to 13% in 2005.
1997, 65% dropped out before the age of 15; down to 30% in 2005.
1997, only 10% sat school leaving certificate; up to 60% 2005.
1997, only 1% entered further education; 10% by 2005.
Gentrification as urban policy!

- Clear that the **major thrust of regeneration would be to transform the social composition** as part of a wider policy of inner-city gentrification and re-valorization of land

- “If you live in a marginalised area, one of the aspects of making it a better place to live is bringing in richer people”. (Senior Planner)
Inner-city Gentrification

- **Soc. Classes I & II** (1991)
  - Males: 21.9%
  - Females: 21.0%

- **3rd-level education** (2002)
  - Males: 15.4%
  - Females: 26.9%

Number of males with 3rd-level education increased from 3,240 to 11,440 individuals

But unemployment among indigenous residents actually increased by 2005
Bord Gais site - detoxification of 29 ha cost € 30M
S.25 Fast-track planning: a new environment – but for whom?
Grand Canal Docks:
Mixture of functions: residential, retailing, cafés, offices, hotel, theatre)
Evidence of gentrification!
Geranium-ification

Bagelisation

Noodlisation

Sushification
GASWORKS SITE

The Gasworks
- 210 pizza wedge apts.

Nov.2005

1-bed from €375,000
2-bed from €480,000
3-bed from €750,000

Car spaces €40,000
• But regarded as a huge success

• "The significant increase in population in the Docklands between recent census periods is evidence of the success of the regeneration process to date, particularly in building the population base and expanding the residential community within the heart of the regeneration area. It is one of the fastest growing areas in the city, region and State”.

• (SDZ Draft Planning Scheme)
Scale of office development on south quays was significant
>740,000 sq.ft. (68,560 sq.m.) complete in just 3 years (2006-8)
Spencer Dock (Treasury Holdings)

- **Planned development**
  - 5.8M sq.ft. (557,000 sq m) in 27 buildings up to 20 storeys high
  - Offices, hotel & 3,000 apts.

- Residents on Abercorn Rd. strongly objected

- Gained backing of financier Dermot Desmond

- Appeared at Oral Hearing with team of lawyers & surveyors

- Scaled back
Spencer Dock apartments

Scaling back of development

But none of the 20% social housing element ever accrued!
......not quite yet anyway!

Huge scale of over-development during the development boom
...office vacancy in Dublin 23%
Number of Developments

(Data source: MacLaran & SavillsHOK, various years)
Office Vacancy, 1992-2010

New Space  Older Space

Plus large quantities of previously-occupied space coming onto market
Unsold Apartments & Vacant Office Space (2010)
Vacancy Rates (%) IFSC/N. Docks & CBD inner fringe

(Data source: MacLaran & SavillsHOK, various years)
Icon of the crash
-Zoe/Daninger’s HQ for Anglo Irish Bank
-the bank at the heart of the crisis
-building taken over as future future HQ of Central Bank of Ireland
Price impacts of property crash: a temporary halt to gentrification
Demise of DDDA

• “The area represents a strategic landbank with economic, cultural, community and recreational assets in the city context and in the national context, a major employment hub and driver of the economy

• ....The Docklands SDZ is of national economic and social importance to the state and ideally placed to build on the economic synergies which have happened to date in order to contribute a real competitive edge to the Dublin region” (DCC, 2013).

NB No reference to indigenous docklands residents
Strategic Development Zone

To ease ‘shortage’ of large office units to attract international dot-com occupiers

To fast-track planning of remaining sites

No appeals to ABP (Planning Appeals Board) once projects passed by Dublin City Council
The vision is that the Docklands SDZ will become a world class maritime quarter with a distinctive Dublin character.

It will be a model of sustainable inner city regeneration incorporating socially inclusive urban neighbourhoods,

a diverse, green innovation based economy contributing to the prosperity of the locality, the city and the country,

all supported by exemplary social and physical infrastructure and a quality public realm integrated with the wider city.

(SDZ Draft Planning Scheme)

Or, in the words of Joe Hill (IWW - USA)

“...you’ll get pie in the sky when you die.”

Worryingly, community gains under DDDA likely to be lost with recent demise of the DDDA
Site delimitation clearly gerrymandered to exclude concentrations of poor indigenous docklands residents.

- Indigenous population
- Being gentrified
- New-build, new residents
• **Reality:** 2011 Census **2,759 households** within the SDZ

• A majority of the residents in the SDZ are professionals

• 78% of adults had a third-level or higher qualification

• **Unemployment rate just 5%** (cf. national average 13%)

• **Conclusion:**
  • There need be no ‘social/community gain’ requirements made of developers