'Henry Smith was very many things, but above all things a most brilliant arithmetician. His most remarkable contributions to the theory [of numbers] are contained in his memoirs on the arithmetical theory of forms, and in particular in the famous memoir on the representation of numbers by sums of five squares, crowned by the Paris Academy and published only after his death'.

[G. H. HARDY, M.A., F.R.S., Savilian Professor of Geometry University of Oxford, 1920.]



Grand Prix des Sciences Mathématiques, 1882.

Henry John Stephen Smith FRS (1826-1883)



The University Museum (Oxford) by John Le Keux (1859)

Grand Prix des Sciences Mathématiques, 1882.



'..... en tout cas soyez assuré que la commission aura par moi connaissance de vos travaux

si elle a se prononcer et à faire un rapport à l'Académie sur des mémoires soumis à son examen'.



Figure 1: Lejeune Dirichlet (1805-1859)

- [1] Gauss, C.F., *Disquisitiones Arithmeticae*, Article 291; Werke, i, 1863, pp. 343 (1801).
- Dirichlet, G.L., Recherches sur diverses applications de l'Analyse infinitésimale à la Théorie des Nombres. Crelle Journal, vol. xix. pp. 324-369 and vol. xxi pp. 1, 134 (1839).
- [3] Eisenstein, F.G.M., 'Note sur la représentation d'un nombre par la somme de cinq carrés'. Crelle's Journal, vol. xxxv. pp. 368 (1847).
- [4] Smith, H.J.S., On the Orders and Genera of Ternary Quadratic Forms. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society, vol. clvii. pp. 255-298 (1867).
- [5] Smith, H.J.S., On the Orders and Genera of Quadratic Forms containing more than Three Indeterminates. Proceedings of the Royal Society, vol. xvi. pp. 197-208 (1867).
- [6] Smith, H.J.S., Mémoire sur la Représentation des Nombres par des Sommes de Cinq Carrés. Mémoires présentés par divers savants à l'Académie des Sciences de l'Institut National de France, vol. xxix, (1882).

[3] Eisenstein, F.G.M., 'Note sur la représentation d'un nombre par la somme de cinq carrés'. Crelle's Journal, Vol. XXXV. pp. 368 (1847).



PROGRAMME DES PRIX PROPOSÉS

POUR LES ANNÉES 1882, 1883, 1884, 1885 ET 1886.

GÉOMÉTRIE.

GRAND PRIX DES SCIENCES MATHEMATIQUES. (Prix du Budget.)

Question proposée pour l'année 1882.

L'Académie propose pour sujet du prix la « Théorie de la décomposition des nombres entiers en une somme de cinq carrés », en appelant particulièrement l'attention des concurrents sur les résultats extrêmement remarquables énoncés sans démonstration par Eisenstein dans une Note écrite en langue française au Tome 35 du Journal de Mathématiques de Crelle (p. 368, année 1847).

Le prix consistera en une médaille de la valeur de trois mille francs.

Les Mémoires devront être remis au Secrétariat avant le 1^{er} juin 1882; ils porteront une épigraphe ou devise répétée dans un billet cacheté qui contiendra le nom et l'adresse de l'auteur. Ce pli ne sera ouvert que si la pièce à laquelle il appartient est couronnée.

Figure 1: Comptes Rendus, Vol. XCIV, p. 330, February 6th, 1882.

Note

The subject of the prize for 1882 had also been announced a year previously, but the notice had escaped his attention. [*Comptes Rendus*, Vol. XCII, p. 622, March 14^{th} , 1881].



Figure 1: James W.L. Glaisher FRS (1848-1928)

'I believe I was the only person who ever knew him really as he was as a mathematician and to whom he opened his heart'.

[Letter: James Glaisher to Thomas H. Escott, April 17th, 1883.]



[Oxford, February 17^{th} , 1882.]

'In the *Royal Society's Proceedings*, I have given the complete theorems, not only for five, but also for seven squares: and though I have not given my demonstration, I have described the general theory from which these theorems are corollaries with some fullness of detail. Ought I to do anything in the matter? My first impression is that I ought to write to Hermite, and call his attention to it. A line or two of advice would really oblige me, as I am somewhat troubled and a little annoyed.'

[Oxford, February 22^{nd} , 1882.]

'You see I take your advice entirely upon the point, that he ought to be written to. The worst of it is that it would take me a year, and a hundred pages, to work out the demonstrations of the paper in the *Royal Society's Proceedings.*'

[Letters: Henry Smith to James Glaisher, February, 1882.]



Figure 1: Charles Hermite (1822-1901)

[Paris, 26 February, 1882].

'Until now, I do not know of any paper submitted. This is explained by the direction of the mathematical trend which is no longer directed towards the arithmetic.

'A circumstance might remove all embarrassment and make his task as easy as pleasant. If he had to take account of a memoir sent by yourself in which you recollect your old researches by completing them, you will see that justice would be restored to you and at the same time the intentions of the Academy would be fulfilled.'

'..... en tout cas soyez assuré que la commission aura par moi connaissance de vos travaux si elle a se prononcer et à faire un rapport à l'Académie sur des mémoires soumis à son examen.'

'..... in any case rest assured that the commission will have my knowledge of your work if it has to make a decision and report to the Academy on memoirs submitted for its consideration.'

[Letter: Charles Hermite to Henry Smith, 26th February, 1882.]

Grand Prix des Sciences Mathématiques, 1882.



'..... en tout cas soyez assuré que la commission aura par moi connaissance de vos travaux

si elle a se prononcer et à faire un rapport à l'Académie sur des mémoires soumis à son examen'.



Figure 1: Comptes Rendus, Vol. XCIV, p. 330, April 2th, 1883.

'.... il serait difficile de signaler dans l'un d'eux une notion ou un théorème important qu'on ne retrouvât pas dans l'autre, et que, pour éviter les redites et faire mieux ressortir les nuances qui les séparent, nous devrons les analyser simultanément.'

'..... it would be difficult to point out in one of them an important notion or theme that is not found in the other, and that, in order to avoid repetition and bring out the nuances that separate them, we had to analyse them simultaneously.'

Note

There is **no mention** of Professor Smith's earlier publication (1867).



Figure 1: Miss Eleanor Smith (1822-1896)

'..... console de la méchanceté de Mlle Smith et des ses ami que m'a attirée un peu de négligence.'

'..... console me from the wickedness of Miss Smith and her friends that a little negligence has attracted me.'

[Letter: Charles Hermite to Leopold Kronecker, May 12^{th} , 1883.]

The award of the prize gave rise to comment in the Paris newspapers.

THE FRENCH ACADEMY HOAXED.

A shameful trick has (the *Times* correspondent says) been played on the Academy of Sciences. The Königsberg student, Hermann Minkowsky, who, with the late Professor Henry J. S. Smith, was declared to have gained the great mathematical prite of 3,000 f., had simply pirated Professor Smith's communication to the Royal Society, in 1868, on the representation of a number as the sum of five squares. He had even copied a slight error in it. The Academy, therefore, at a secret session, has annulled its original decision, and decreed that the whole prize had been gained by the English professor.

Figure 1: The Times (Paris Correspondent) April 12^{th} , 1883.

MEETING OF THE FRENCH ACADEMY (The response of the Academy to criticism) April 16^{th} , 1883.

An appreciative obituary of Professor Smith by M. Camille Jordan.

'It was difficult to imagine that two geometers were clever enough to traverse this elevated ground, but a narrow pen, did not meet there on more than one point. The methods show an analogy, but each memoir bore the mark of an original and distinguished spirit'

[Commissaire: M. Bertrand]

'.... the terms of the award are inconsistent with this ingenious explanation.'
'The moral of the affair evidently is that care must henceforth be taken in the selection of subjects for prizes.'

[The Globe (London), April 17^{th} , 1883.]

The oversight by the French Academy can be easily explained.



Was there a NATIONAL BARRIER between Britain and the Continent?

 [6] Smith, H.J.S., Mémoire sur la Représentation des Nombres par des Sommes de Cinq Carrés. Mémoires présentés par divers savants à l'Académie des Sciences de l'Institut National de France, vol. xxix, (1882).

Let $\Phi_5(\Omega^2 \Delta)$ denote the number of *primitive* representations of $\Omega^2 \Delta$ as a sum of 5 squares.

 $[\Delta \text{ not divisible by any square.}]$ [[] extends over every odd prime q dividing Ω but not Δ]

For $\Delta \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$

$$\Phi_5(\Omega^2 \Delta) = 5\eta \times \frac{\Omega^3}{\Delta} \times \prod_q \left[1 - \left(\frac{\Delta}{q}\right) \frac{1}{q^2} \right] \times \sum_{s=1}^{\Delta} \left(\frac{s}{\Delta}\right) s(s-\Delta)$$

where s is prime to Δ . Furthermore, $\eta = 12$ if $\Delta \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$. $\eta = 28$ if $\Delta \equiv 5 \pmod{8}$, $\Omega \equiv 1 \pmod{2}$. $\eta = 20$ if $\Delta \equiv 5 \pmod{8}$, $\Omega \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$. Finally, if $\Delta = 1$ we replace $\eta \times \prod$ by 2.

For every other case

$$\Phi_5(\Omega^2 \Delta) = 5\eta \times \frac{\Omega^3}{\Delta} \times \prod_q \left[1 - \left(\frac{\Delta}{q}\right) \frac{1}{q^2} \right] \times \sum_{s=1}^{4\Delta} \left(\frac{\Delta}{s}\right) s(s - 4\Delta)$$

where s is prime to 4 Δ . Furthermore, $\eta = 1$ if $\Omega \equiv 1 \pmod{2}$. $\eta = \frac{1}{2}$ if $\Omega \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$.

* Evaluation the above at $\Omega = 1$ reduce to Eisenstein's formulation from 1847.

Example

Evaluate $\Phi_5(45)$.

Firstly, the *primitive* representations of 45 are

$$0^{2} + 0^{2} + 2^{2} + 4^{2} + 5^{2}$$

$$0^{2} + 1^{2} + 2^{2} + 2^{2} + 6^{2}$$

$$0^{2} + 2^{2} + 3^{2} + 4^{2} + 4^{2}$$

$$1^{2} + 1^{2} + 3^{2} + 3^{2} + 5^{2}$$

Let $\Omega^2 \Delta = 3^2 5 = 45$.

Now $\Delta \equiv 5 \pmod{8}$ and $\Omega \equiv 1 \pmod{2}$, hence $\eta = 28$.

$$\Phi_5(45) = 5 \times 28 \times \frac{3^3}{5} \times \left[1 - \left(\frac{5}{3}\right)\frac{1}{3^2}\right] \times \sum_{s=1}^5 \left(\frac{s}{5}\right)s(s-5)$$

Now

$$\sum_{s=1}^{5} \left(\frac{s}{5}\right) s(s-5) = 4$$

Finally

$$\Phi_5(45) = 5 \times 28 \times \frac{3^3}{5} \times \frac{10}{9} \times 4 = 3,360.$$



The University Museum (Oxford) by John Le Keux (1859)